
Stream: Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF)
RFC: [0000](#)
Updates: [5892](#)
Category: Standards Track
Published: March 2020
ISSN: 2070-1721
Author: J. Doe

RFC 0000

Sample

Abstract

The standards for Internationalized Domain Names in Applications (IDNA) require a review of each new version of Unicode to determine whether incompatibilities with prior versions or other issues exist and, where appropriate, to allow the IETF to decide on the trade-offs between compatibility with prior IDNA versions and compatibility with Unicode going forward. That requirement, and its relationship to tables maintained by IANA, has caused significant confusion in the past. This document makes adjustments to the review procedure based on experience and updates IDNA, specifically RFC 5892, to reflect those changes and to clarify the various relationships involved. It also makes other minor adjustments to align that document with experience.

Status of This Memo

This is an Internet Standards Track document.

This document is a product of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). It represents the consensus of the IETF community. It has received public review and has been approved for publication by the Internet Engineering Steering Group (IESG). Further information on Internet Standards is available in Section 2 of RFC 7841.

Information about the current status of this document, any errata, and how to provide feedback on it may be obtained at <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc0000>.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2020 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions

with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Table of Contents

- 1. [Review Model Part I: Algorithmic Comparison](#)
- 2. [References](#)
 - 2.1. [Normative References](#)
 - 2.2. [Informative References](#)

[Author's Address](#)

1. Review Model Part I: Algorithmic Comparison

TESTING:

- (i) [Section 5.1](#) of [[RFC5892](#)]
- (ii) [Section 5.1](#) of RFC 5892 [[RFC5892](#)]
- (iii) [Section 5.1](#) of RFC 5892
- (iv) [Section 5.1](#) of [RFC 5892](#) [[RFC5892](#)]

is the description of the process for creating the initial IANA tables. It is noteworthy that, while it can be read as strongly implying new reviews and new tables for versions of Unicode after 5.2, it does not explicitly specify those reviews or, e.g., the timetable for completing them. It also indicates that incompatibilities are to be "flagged for the IESG" but does not specify exactly what the IESG is to do about them and when. For reasons related to the other type of review and discussed below, only one review was completed, documented [[RFC6452](#)], and a set of corresponding new tables installed. That review, which was for Unicode 6.0, found only three incompatibilities; the consensus was to ignore them (not create exceptions in IDNA2008) and to remain consistent with computations based on current (Unicode 6.0) properties rather than preserving backward compatibility within IDNA. The 2018 review (for Unicode 11.0 and versions in between it and 6.0) [[IDNA-Unicode12](#)] also concluded that Unicode compatibility, rather than IDNA backward compatibility, should be maintained. That decision was partially driven by the long period between reviews and the concern that table calculations by others in the interim could result in unexpected incompatibilities if derived property definitions were then changed.

2. References

2.1. Normative References

[[Err3312](#)] RFC Errata, Erratum ID 3312, RFC 5892, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/errata/eid3312>>.

- [IANA-IDNA-Tables]** IANA, "IDNA Rules and Derived Property Values", <<https://www.iana.org/assignments/idna-tables>>.
- [RFC5892]** Faltstrom, P., Ed., "The Unicode Code Points and Internationalized Domain Names for Applications (IDNA)", RFC 5892, DOI 10.17487/RFC5892, August 2010, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5892>>.
- [RFC8126]** Cotton, M., Leiba, B., and T. Narten, "Guidelines for Writing an IANA Considerations Section in RFCs", BCP 26, RFC 8126, DOI 10.17487/RFC8126, June 2017, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8126>>.
- [Unicode]** The Unicode Consortium, "The Unicode Standard (Current Version)", 2019, <<http://www.unicode.org/versions/latest/>>.
- [Unicode-properties]** The Unicode Consortium, "The Unicode Standard Version 11.0", Section 3.5, 2018, <<https://www.unicode.org/versions/Unicode11.0.0/>>.

2.2. Informative References

- [IAB-Unicode-2018]** Internet Architecture Board (IAB), "IAB Statement on Identifiers and Unicode", 15 March 2018, <<https://www.iab.org/documents/correspondence-reports-documents/2018-2/iab-statement-on-identifiers-and-unicode/>>.
- [IAB-Unicode7-2015]** Internet Architecture Board (IAB), "IAB Statement on Identifiers and Unicode 7.0.0", 11 February 2015, <<https://www.iab.org/documents/correspondence-reports-documents/2015-2/iab-statement-on-identifiers-and-unicode-7-0-0/>>.
- [ICANN-LGR-SLA]** Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN), "Proposed IANA SLAs for Publishing LGRs/IDN Tables", 10 June 2019, <<https://www.icann.org/public-comments/proposed-iana-sla-lgr-idn-tables-2019-06-10-en>>.
- [IDNA-Unicode11]** Faltstrom, P., "IDNA2008 and Unicode 11.0.0", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-faltstrom-unicode11-08, 11 March 2019, <<https://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-faltstrom-unicode11-08>>.
- [IDNA-Unicode12]** Faltstrom, P., "IDNA2008 and Unicode 12.0.0", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-faltstrom-unicode12-00, 11 March 2019, <<https://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-faltstrom-unicode12-00>>.
- [IDNA-Unicode7]** Klensin, J. and P. Faltstrom, "IDNA Update for Unicode 7.0 and Later Versions", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-klensin-idna-5892upd-unicode70-05, 8 October 2017, <<https://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-klensin-idna-5892upd-unicode70-05>>.
- [RegRestr]** Klensin, J. and A. Freytag, "Internationalized Domain Names in Applications (IDNA): Registry Restrictions and Recommendations", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-klensin-idna-rfc5891bis-05, 29 August 2019, <<https://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-klensin-idna-rfc5891bis-05>>.

- [RFC1766] Alvestrand, H., "Tags for the Identification of Languages", RFC 1766, DOI 10.17487/RFC1766, March 1995, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc1766>>.
- [RFC3282] Alvestrand, H., "Content Language Headers", RFC 3282, DOI 10.17487/RFC3282, May 2002, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3282>>.
- [RFC3454] Hoffman, P. and M. Blanchet, "Preparation of Internationalized Strings ("stringprep")", RFC 3454, DOI 10.17487/RFC3454, December 2002, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3454>>.
- [RFC3490] Faltstrom, P., Hoffman, P., and A. Costello, "Internationalizing Domain Names in Applications (IDNA)", RFC 3490, DOI 10.17487/RFC3490, March 2003, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3490>>.
- [RFC3491] Hoffman, P. and M. Blanchet, "Nameprep: A Stringprep Profile for Internationalized Domain Names (IDN)", RFC 3491, DOI 10.17487/RFC3491, March 2003, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3491>>.
- [RFC3629] Yergeau, F., "UTF-8, a transformation format of ISO 10646", STD 63, RFC 3629, DOI 10.17487/RFC3629, November 2003, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3629>>.
- [RFC4690] Klensin, J., Faltstrom, P., Karp, C., and IAB, "Review and Recommendations for Internationalized Domain Names (IDNs)", RFC 4690, DOI 10.17487/RFC4690, September 2006, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4690>>.
- [RFC5646] Phillips, A., Ed. and M. Davis, Ed., "Tags for Identifying Languages", BCP 47, RFC 5646, DOI 10.17487/RFC5646, September 2009, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5646>>.
- [RFC5890] Klensin, J., "Internationalized Domain Names for Applications (IDNA): Definitions and Document Framework", RFC 5890, DOI 10.17487/RFC5890, August 2010, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5890>>.
- [RFC5894] Klensin, J., "Internationalized Domain Names for Applications (IDNA): Background, Explanation, and Rationale", RFC 5894, DOI 10.17487/RFC5894, August 2010, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5894>>.
- [RFC6452] Faltstrom, P., Ed. and P. Hoffman, Ed., "The Unicode Code Points and Internationalized Domain Names for Applications (IDNA) - Unicode 6.0", RFC 6452, DOI 10.17487/RFC6452, November 2011, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6452>>.

Author's Address

John Doe